

JUDICIAL ROLE IN GLOBALISED ECONOMY

(WITH A FOCUS ON TAX TREATIES)

(Pax Mercatus)

THE 2012 WEB EDITION

ARRANGEMENT OF SUBJECT

INTRODUCTION

PAGE

I

ON THE NAME OF THE BOOK

Prelude	1
---------------	---

II

THE THEMATIC STRUCTURE CHAPTER WISE

The First Cluster	5
The Second Cluster	6
The Third Cluster	7
The Fourth Cluster	9
The Fifth Cluster	10

III

A PERSONAL EXPLANATION

Genesis & Context	12
-------------------------	----

IV

AN APOLOGIA AT THE THRESHOLD

CHAPTER I

TOWARDS THE SPONSORED STATE

1. The Evolution of the idea of the 'sponsored state'	17
2. The Broad Features of the Sponsored State.....	21

CHAPTER 2

AN OPAQUE SYSTEM

1. Darkness delights where realities are to be evaded	33
2. Denial of the Right to the Freedom of Expression	34

	PAGE
3. Opaque System is the best for the corrupt.....	36
4. Our Raw Realities.....	37
5. The instruments of Darkness	39
High technology.....	40
PEPs.....	40
6. The shrinking State, and the waxing power of the commercial gladiators.	42
7. The loot in darkness.....	45
8. A specimen of the craft of the crafty	46
9. The Remedy against the Executive Power	47
10. The vice of excessive delegation.....	48
11. An eclipse of transparency	48
12. A sponsored state syndrome: and the tax law	49

CHAPTER 3

NOT ON THE LORD SHIVA’S TRIDENT

1. The judiciary to “the state” as defined in Art 12 of the constitution	51
2. The irrelevance of the factor of a court being “superior” or “inferior”	71
3. The irrelevance of the factor of a court being “the Court of Record”	73
4. Errors in ratio analysis of precedents cited	73
5. On the “CONCESSION” by the counsels.....	77
6. Position under the Constitution of the Federal Republic of Germany	79
7. “State” in Modern English Usage.....	80
8. An Examination From The International Law Point of View: Judiciary is ‘State’.....	80
9. Conclusion	81

CHAPTER 4

THE FRONTIERS OF THE DOCTRINE OF *EX DEBITO JUSTITIAE*

1. Remedy after Review under Art 137 of the Constitution (The Rule in Rupa’s Case).....	83
2. Taints can overtake even after a proper commencement.....	86
3. The inherent power of Court and the concept of ex debito justitiae	87
4. Judicial Correction Ex debito justitiae	90
5. Decision per incuriam of the constitutional or statutory provisions	90
6. Decisions without jurisdiction	91
7. Anachronistic view of “jurisdiction”	94
8. The conventional view of “jurisdiction”	94
9. The notion of ‘jurisdiction’ in the post-Constitution era, and the role of certiorari.....	96
10. Legal distortions	99
11. Decision in breach of the Rules of Natural Justice	100
12. Judicial Faults are not to cause a prejudice	101
13. A Critique of Azadi Bachao’s Case	102
14. Some jurisdictional lapses in Azadi Bachao	103
15. Some instances of legal distortions	105
16. Infraction of the Rules of Natural Justice.....	108
17. Conclusion	110

CHAPTER 5
**JUDICIAL HIERARCHY AND THE
 RESULTANT NORMS**

1. A precedent is binding as a rule of law	115
2. The status of this rule	118
3. The Operational Style of the Rule.....	118
4. When the rule is plucked up by the root.....	119

CHAPTER 6
MCDOWELL: THE DECISION AND THE *RATIO*

1. McDowell when properly read	130
2. Ratio Analysis.....	135
3. Historical Perspective.....	140
4. Judicial Role: Causa causans.....	141
5. Judicial remedy against an entente cordiale of Collusion and Fraud	142
6. The present status of McDowell	143

CHAPTER 7
**THE PRAGMATICS OF THE RIGHT
 JUDICIAL ROLE**

1. The Narrowing of the Judicial Role.....	146
2. The Flawed Judicial Thesis Soon Reversed.....	146
3. Further Reevaluation of Ideas	152
(a) The judicial view is anachronistic.....	153
(b) The British ideas on the judicial role.....	155
(c) The great U.S. judges delineate their role, which is comprehensive and creative at the same time	156
(i) Holmes:	156
(ii) Cardozo	156
(iii) Warren	157
4. The Warren approach and the Welfare State	158
5. Perspective under our Constitution is materially different.....	159
6. Judicial pragmatism and the operative realities of our times	160
7. The <i>Cri de Coeur</i> to Parliament: an exercise in futility.....	161
8. A Judicial Oxymoron & The Judicial <i>Cri De Cœur</i>	164
9. Our Supreme Court in <i>Ramachandra Rao v. State of Karnataka</i>	167
10. Lesson that the story of the <i>I.T.C. Case</i> teaches	173
11. What our Superior Courts can do in matters involving a tax treaty.....	174
12. The Limits of the Doctrine of Restraints	176
13. Great Expectations.....	178

CHAPTER 8
**READING WITH DISCRIMINATION ON THE USE OF A
TEXTBOOK IN A JUDICIAL PROCEEDING**

1.	Norms for selecting Books for Judicial Reliance	181
2.	A Telling case study	185
	(i) As to the credentials of the author.....	185
	(ii) As to the worth of his exposition	188

CHAPTER 9
**A CORPORATION CANNOT BE AN IMPERVIOUS
COVERLET OF GROSS ABUSE**

1.	The Implications of Incorporation.....	197
	(i) When it is fair and just to explore the inner realities.....	198
	(ii) Public Policy and Corporate Personality.....	199
2.	A Corporation cannot be an impervious cover-let of gross abuse	200
3.	A ‘Corporation’s Residence’	208
	(i) Not a public law approach	209
	(ii) The judicial approach and the modern realities	211

CHAPTER 10
FRAUD UNRAVELS EVERYTHING

PART A

I

1.	Judicial Abhorrence to Fraud	213
----	------------------------------------	-----

II

2.	The Legal Propositions emerging from the judicial decisions	216
----	---	-----

III

3.	Let us not confuse the granter of benefits with the grantees of benefits.....	218
----	---	-----

IV

4.	How much of fraud invalidates	219
----	-------------------------------------	-----

Part B

5.	An instance of the touch of Comus.....	220
----	--	-----

CHAPTER 11
TREATY SHOPPING

1.	The concept of “Treaty Shopping” Explained	225
2.	Beneficiaries under A Tax-treaty	229
	(i) Reductio Ad Absurdum	235
3.	Treaty Shopping: how dealt with in other jurisdictions.....	236
	(i) Countermeasures.....	236

	PAGE
(ii) “Opinion on the question whether a bilateral treaty between two states affect the Nationals of a third state not a party to such treaty”	238
4. Great Expectations.....	240
(i) Will our Parliament pay heed to the Report of the CAG? “Our representatives, speak for India !”	240
5. Right Perspective	241

CHAPTER 12
SUPREME COURT ON TREATY SHOPPING

1. Supreme Court on Treaty Shopping.....	243
2. Lord McNair’s view examined.....	254

CHAPTER 13
**THE CAG ON TREATY SHOPPING:
AN ALARMING EXPOSE**

1. The CAG's Report No. 13 of 2005.....	263
(i) On the JPC Report.....	273
(ii) Treaty Shopping.....	274

CHAPTER 14
**INTERNATIONAL LAW AND THE FOREIGN
ADMINISTRATIVE ACTS**

1. The needs of the Time	279
2. Our Raw Realities.....	280
3. Norms of comity do not apply in revenue law	284
4. Certificate of Residence	284
5. The Rules of Interpretation	286
6. Let us read the text of tears	289

CHAPTER 15
TREATY-MAKING POWER

1. Treaty-Making Power	293
2. Inherent Part of Sovereign Power.....	295
3. British Model adjusted with our constitutional provisions.....	300
4. The British Practice.....	301
5. Deductions From The British Practice	304
6. Treaty making power under our constitutional polity	306
7. Some new aspects of the matter that have gone unnoticed	311
8. The Role of our superior courts.....	312
9. Some Recommendations	313

CHAPTER 16
**QUIS CUSTODIET IPSOS CUSTODES
WHO WILL WATCH THE WATCHMEN?**

1. Watching the ways of the Watchers.....	315
---	-----

	PAGE
2. Our diplomatic mission: a pathetic performance	320
3. The role of the Comptroller and Auditor-General of India	321
4. Bureaucracy	321
5. The decline of Parliament	323
6. Public Opinion	324

CHAPTER 17

A MORBID STORY OF THE INDO-MAURITIUS DTAC

1. A Factual backdrop	327
2. The Section 90(1) of the Income-tax Act	330
3. Meaning of <i>Avoidance of Double Taxation of Income</i>	334
4. The Travesty of the Personal Scope	335
5. Treaty shopping: the <i>causa proxima</i>	335
6. Misuse of the DTAC by the Indian residents	336
7. The Phantoms of Delight	336
8. Recovery of taxes	339
9. Mutual Agreement Procedure (MAP)	339

CHAPTER 18

THE URUGUAY ROUND FINAL ACT: A BETRAYAL OF THE NATION

1. A Treaty : <i>Sui Generis</i>	341
2. India's Handling of the Uruguay Round negotiations	344
3. Constitutionality of the Final Act Federal Character of our Constitution was ignored	346
4. Our Fundamental Rights threatened	349
5. Certain fundamentals of our democratic polity are under risk	351
6. Our Sovereignty is compromised	352
7. Some Suggestions by the Peoples' Commission	353
8. The Author's Recommendations	356

CHAPTER 19

STATUS OF A TAX TREATY *VIS-A-VIS* THE STATUTE

1. Judicial Observations	359
2. Case law noticed: manifest mis-direction	362
3. Legislative indications	369
4. Law as judicially declared	370
5. Conclusion	370

CHAPTER 20

A PARADIGM SHIFT IN TAX JURISPRUDENCE

1. The Prelude	373
2. A Paradigm shift examined under a Historical Perspective	374
3. McDowell's Case	380
(a) Historical Perspective adopted	380
(b) A Judicial Approach	381
(c) The duty of the court in cases where tax avoidance device is at work	381

	PAGE
4. Quest for justice	383
5. Azadi Bachao on McDowell: an unauthorised adventure causing Public Concern	384

CHAPTER 21

CBDT'S CIRCULAR MAKING POWER: FRONTIERS STILL TO BE SETTLED

1. A Point at the threshold	389
2. The Terms of Section 119 of the Income-tax Act 1961	392
(i) Affirmative Points	394
(ii) Negative Points	394
3. The Object & Purpose of the Income-tax Act 1961	394
4. Summary of Points relating to the powers of the CBDT to issue Circulars	397
5. The Supreme Court on the CBDT's Circular Making Power.....	398
6. Can a circular deviate even from the Act?.....	407
7. The Rule of Law	409
8. The Role of the Statutory Authorities.....	409
9. The issue in a wider gestalt	409

CHAPTER 22

PUBLIC INTEREST LITIGATION IN REVENUE MATTERS

1. The concept of <i>locus standi</i> widened	411
2. <i>IRC v. National Federation of Self Employed Small Business Ltd.</i> Analysed.....	413
3. A PIL in Revenue Matters in India	416
4. Changing Judicial Attitudes to PIL.....	420

CHAPTER 23

AN EPILOGUE.....	423
-------------------------	-----